



RESEARCH FOR TODAY
LIMITED

77 Gunnersbury Avenue, London W5 4LP

Telephone: 020 8992 4877

Fax: 020 8993 5818

E-mail simalto@researchfortoday.com

Bournemouth Borough Council

2010 Budget Input Consultation Using SIMALTO Modelling

December 2009

Contents

Background	3
Main objectives	3
Method	4
Sample.....	6
Headline results.....	7
SIMALTO Grid Summary Information.....	11
Satisfaction with Alternative Scenarios.....	12
Willingness to pay for Alternative Scenarios	13
Modelling SIMALTO Data	14
Optimum Best Value Total Budgets.....	15
Best Value Hierarchy Index.....	21
Satisfaction Predictions for Respondent Optimum Budgets	23
Preference between Alternative Budgets.....	24
Appendix 1: Summary Data	26
Appendix 2: Main Stage Questionnaire.....	37
Appendix 3: SIMALTO Grid	45

Background

- Bournemouth Borough Council desired resident input to their 2010 Budget Allocation decision making process
- In order that this should be as relevant and accurate possible, the SIMALTO Modelling approach was adopted
- This method asks respondents to make their priorities from a choice of defined alternative levels of each service
- Their choices are ‘realistic’ since the relative saving costs of each different service level are shown to residents, and they only have fixed, constrained budgets to allocate across the competing service levels
- This recognises some changes save more than others, and residents (councils) cannot spend the same money twice

Main Objectives

Bournemouth Borough Council wanted to know resident feelings about the allocation of council tax between various services in 2010 and beyond.

- It was likely that the council would have to make savings on many of its services in order to keep to an inflation only increase in council tax. Which current service levels could be reduced by how much and cause least ‘distress’ among residents?
- Would residents be willing to pay more council tax, beyond an inflation annual increase, to minimise savings in service benefits?

Method

Bournemouth Council had prepared a matrix with 20 attributes showing different services on which the council might change its service level from 2009 to 2010 (See SIMALTO Grid in Appendix 2). Individual alternative levels of service are described, each with the relative cost of their change from other levels of the same attribute, e.g. closing 2 youth centres (4 units, (7 - 3) on attribute 17 saves twice as much as evening cleaning of town centres only at weekends (2 units, (5 - 3) on attribute 4).

Very approximately, 1 point on the grid represents £30,000 of council budget, and the current service 'costs' 124 units on the grid. Respondents were invited to carefully read the whole matrix, and then carry out the following tasks

Task 1

Cross out any options they thought were unacceptable, i.e. would cause them to complain or seriously consider doing so if this level of service was provided.

Task 2

Allocate 30 points on improving the overall service from this basic first option box position (first priorities). Show this by drawing red arrows.

Task 3

Allocate a further 20 points – second priority improvements. Show this by drawing black arrows.

Task 4

Allocate a further 20 points – third priority improvements. Show this by drawing green arrows.

Task 5

Allocate a final 20 points of improvements – fourth priorities. Show this by drawing blue arrows.

An illustration of a completed part grid is shown below.

Bournemouth budget consultancy

SERVICE		OPTIONS				
1	CCTV cameras	80 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots in Bournemouth Town Centre only 0	50 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots 1	20 fewer cameras 2	As now – 140 CCTV cameras covering the Town centre, Boscombe, the seafront and Charminster 3	
2	Fund for tackling anti-social behaviour	No budget – no quick response to anti-social behaviour problems. Unable to take out any ASBOs or close drug dens. 0	Reduction in the speed and number of response to anti-social behaviour problems 1	As now – quick response to anti-social behaviour with measures such as anti-social behaviour orders (ASBOs), alleyway closures, closing drug dens etc. 2		
3	Public toilets (excluding parks)	Permanently close 14 seafront toilets and 18 other public toilets 0	Permanently close 12 seafront and 12 other public toilets 5	Permanently close 6 seafront and 6 other public toilets 10	Close 9 seafront toilets between October and March 15	As now – 17 seafront toilets plus 23 other public toilets across borough 16
4	Evening cleaning of Bournemouth, Boscombe and Charminster town centres	Stop evening cleaning 0	Saturday night cleaning only 1	Weekend nights only 3	5 nights per week 4	As now – evening cleansing 7 nights per week 5
5	Litter picking and sweeping of residential roads & outlying shopping areas	No routine cleaning of residential roads, respond to complaints only 0	Clean or inspect every 24 weeks 4	Clean or inspect every 16 weeks 7	Clean or inspect every 8 weeks 10	As now - residential roads & outlying shopping areas are cleaned or inspected every 4 weeks 13
6	Refuse and Re-cycling collection	Risk of missed bin approx every 12 months 0	Risk of missed bin approx every 15 months 3	Risk of missed bin approx every 18 months 6	Risk of missed bin approx every 21 months 9	As now – very reliable service. Risk of a missed bin collection approx once every 24 months. 12
7	Road and footpath repairs	Repaired within 14 days 0	Repaired within 7 days 1	Repaired within 5 days 2	Repaired within 3 days 3	As now – Defects which could endanger pedestrians or cyclists are repaired within 24 hours 4
8	Out of hours service	24 hour service in winter only 0	24hour service during the winter and weekends only in summer time 1	As now – 24 hour emergency service all year round covering things like winter gritting, clearing up after traffic accidents / vandalism, removal of fallen trees, creating diversions away from dangerous buildings etc. 3		
9	Day centres for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities	Centres only available to isolated housebound clients or those whose carer is unable to cope alone 0	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 3 days per week 7	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 4 days per week 10	Close 1 centre and send its clients to other day centres 13	As now – 9 day care centres which some clients attend 5 days per week 16
10	Home care for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities	Only fund home care to the cost of residential care 0	Limit spending on a client's home care to £50 per week more than residential care costs 1	Limit spending to £100 per week more 2	Limit spending to £150 per week 3	As now – Council supports people to live in their own home even when this costs more than residential care 4

After each of Tasks 2 to 5, respondents indicated how 'pleased' they would be if this improved level of service were to be provided (with no associated change in council tax being implied).

Task 6

Finally respondents were told that each of their improvement scenarios would result in different levels of council tax being applied. The different scenarios would impact this 'increase' as follows:

- +30 point priorities £8 decrease 16p per week less
- +50 point priorities No change
- +70 point priorities £8 increase 16p per week increase
- +90 point priorities £16 increase 30p per week increase

Respondents were asked which of their alternative improvement scenarios, with associated tax impacts, they would choose.

Sample

The questionnaire was put on the RFT website and of almost 1000 visitors to the site, 456 completed it of which 256 were non council employees that lived in the district. 112 employees and 70 voluntary staff completed the web questionnaire (of which 86 and 61 respectively lived in the council area).

Further demographic details of the 256 resident sample are :-

Male 63%	Female 37%		
White 97%	Non white 3%		
British 97%	Non British 3%		
Full council tax payer 79%	Reduced council tax payer 14%		
Under 35 years 18%	35-54 years 35%	55-64 years 25%	65+ years 22%
Christian 53%	No religion 33%	Other religion 4%	No answer 10%
Heterosexual 79%	Gay man/woman 7%	Bisexual 1%	No answer 13%

A sample size of 250 residents has proved to be sufficient to obtain good modelling information. An English county recently conducted 500 Simalto interviews. We created an interim model after 250 interviews and this showed identical optimum budget allocations to the one created after 500 interviews. (A paper discussing this consultation is available.).

A web sample cannot be guaranteed to be representative, but Bournemouth officers made great efforts to recruit extensively and widely. However, where other UK councils have conducted both face-to-face and web based interviews residents' priorities have proved to be very similar in the 2 samples.

In addition, a workshop was held with councilors and 16 completed the survey in its paper and pen format. Council staff also conducted paper and pen format face-to-face interviews with 44 residents. These were targeted mainly at people from deprived areas and / or with lower levels of educational attainment who were less likely to take part online. A number of these interviews were also conducted with representatives of Dorset Race Equality Council.

SIMALTO budget consultation - headline results

The grid below shows where residents who took part in the Council's online budget consultation exercise would most favour service reductions at each given budget.

The results can be interpreted thus:

The pink squares show where residents would most favour savings to be made if it was necessary to make an approx £600k budget reduction across these 20 services. These are essentially the service elements which residents would find easiest to sacrifice.

The green squares show which further service reductions residents would most favour, if it was necessary to make an approx £1.2m budget reduction across these 20 services.

The yellow squares show which further service reductions residents would most favour, if it was necessary to make an approx £1.8m budget reduction across these 20 services.

The blue squares show which further service reductions residents would most favour, if it was necessary to make an approx £2.4m budget reduction across these 20 services.

For each of the 20 services listed, the severity of service reductions increases from right (starting with the service level provided 'as now') to left. You will see that as the level of required budget savings increases so does the level of service reduction necessary to meet that budget.

Squares remaining white are those which residents would most favour preserving, even after making £2.4m budget cuts.

-£600K	-£1.2M	-£1.8M	-£2.4M		
Least worse	Next least worse	Next least worse	Next least worse	Resist making savings	As now

SERVICE		OPTIONS				
1	CCTV cameras	80 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots in Bournemouth Town Centre only 0	50 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots 1	20 fewer cameras 2	As now – 140 CCTV cameras covering the Town centre, Boscombe, the seafront and Charminster 3	
2	Fund for tackling anti-social behaviour	No budget – no quick response to anti-social behaviour problems. Unable to take out any ASBOs or close drug dens. 0	Reduction in the speed and number of response to anti-social behaviour problems 1		As now – quick response to anti-social behaviour with measures such as anti-social behaviour orders (ASBOs), alleyway closures, closing drug dens etc. 2	
3	Public toilets (excluding parks)	Permanently close 14 seafront toilets and 18 other public toilets 0	Permanently close 12 seafront and 12 other public toilets 5	Permanently close 6 seafront and 6 other public toilets 10	Close 9 seafront toilets between October and March 15	As now – 17 seafront toilets plus 23 other public toilets across borough 16
4	Evening cleaning of Bournemouth, Boscombe and Charminster town centres	Stop evening cleaning 0	Saturday night cleaning only 1	Weekend nights only 3	5 nights per week 4	As now – evening cleansing 7 nights per week 5
5	Litter picking and sweeping of residential roads & outlying shopping areas	No routine cleaning of residential roads, respond to complaints only 0	Clean or inspect every 24 weeks 4	Clean or inspect every 16 weeks 7	Clean or inspect every 8 weeks - 10	As now - residential roads & outlying shopping areas are cleaned or inspected every 4 weeks 13
6	Refuse and Re-cycling collection	Risk of missed bin approx every 12 months 0	Risk of missed bin approx every 15 months 3	Risk of missed bin approx every 18 months 6	Risk of missed bin approx every 21 months 9	As now – very reliable service. Risk of a missed bin collection approx once every 24 months. 12
7	Road and footpath repairs	Repaired within 14 days 0	Repaired within 7 days 1	Repaired within 5 days 2	Repaired within 3 days 3	As now – Defects which could endanger pedestrians or cyclists are repaired within 24 hours 4
8	Out of hours service	24 hour service in winter only	24hour service during the winter and weekends only in summer time	As now – 24 hour emergency service all year round covering things like winter gritting, clearing up after traffic accidents / vandalism, removal of fallen trees, creating diversions away from dangerous buildings etc.		

		0	1			3
9	Day centres for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities	Centres only available to isolated housebound clients or those whose carer is unable to cope alone 0	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 3 days per week 7	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 4 days per week 10	Close 1 centre and send its clients to other day centres 13	As now – 9 day care centres which some clients attend 5 days per week 16
10	Home care for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities	Only fund home care to the cost of residential care 0	Limit spending on a client's home care to £50 per week more than residential care costs 1	Limit spending to £100 per week more 2	Limit spending to £150 per week 3	As now – Council supports people to live in their own home even when this costs more than residential care 4
11	Grass cutting of verges and residential areas	Reduce grass cutting to every 4 weeks in Summer AND stop grass cutting in Winter 0		Stop grass cutting in Winter 3	As now – every 2/3 weeks in Summer and every 6 weeks in Winter 4	
12	Car park charges in parks and public open spaces	Introduce a fee of 50 pence / hr at all other parks AND increase charges by 50p pence / hr where charges already apply 0		Increase car parking charges by 50 pence / hour where charges already apply 1	As now – charges apply at Hengistbury Head, the seafront and Tuckton tea gardens. Free parking in other parks. 2	
13	Bowling greens maintenance	Council stops maintaining bowling greens. Clubs responsible for paying for own maintenance. 0	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and increases players' fees by £100 per year 3	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and increases players' fees by £50 per year 5	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and fees stay the same, 7	As now – Council maintains 16 bowling greens. Fees are £120 per year per player. 10
14	Trees	Service only deals with dangerous trees and keeping roads and footpaths clear 0	No preventative tree maintenance. Service responds to complaints only. 2	Charge a fee to deal with complaints about trees encroaching on private properties 3	As now - inspect and maintain half a million trees on public land 5	
15	Flower baskets and pedestals	Remove floral baskets on Wessex Way and Castle Lane AND Bournemouth Town Centre 0		Remove floral baskets on Wessex Way and Castle Lane 1	As now – Floral baskets in key locations across the Borough 2	
16	Subsidised bus routes	Cut 4 routes – affect 94000 passenger journeys per year	Cut 3 routes – affect 42000 passenger journeys per year	Cut 2 routes – affect 13000 passenger journeys per year	Cut one route – affect 3000 passenger journeys per year	As now – Council subsidises 30 bus routes 5

		0	2	3	4	
17	Youth centres	Close 4 youth centres – 0	Close 3 youth centres – 2	Close 2 youth centres – 3	Close 1 youth centre – 5	As now – 9 Council funded youth centres 7
18	Grass cutting in cemeteries and crematorium	Grass cut at beginning and end of Summer season only 0	Grass cut every 8 weeks in summer 1	Grass cut every 6 weeks in summer 2	As now – Grass cut and strimmed around graves and headstones once a month in Summer season 3	
19	Environmental Health, Trading Standards and Licensing	Only businesses which pose highest risk are inspected AND low risk complaints are not investigated. 0	Medium risk businesses are only inspected if we receive a complaint AND low risk complaints are not investigated. 2	Low risk complaints are not investigated e.g. dog fouling, poor labelling, food product complaints etc 3	As now – all complaints are investigated AND medium and high risk business premises are routinely inspected 4	
20	Enforcement of planning permission	No checks and service only responds to complaints about dangerous or listed buildings 0	No checks and no response to complaints about extensions or small developments 1	No checks – service only deals with complaints 2	Check large new builds only and deal with all complaints 3	As now – Council checks all new builds, investigates complaints and enforces planning permission where breaches found 4

SIMALTO Grid Summary Information

A summary of the service option priorities given by seminar-respondents is shown below, illustrated by the Environmental health attribute. This data for all service attributes is given in Appendix 1.

The interpretation of this data is as follows.

Attribute 11) Grass cutting			
	Every 4 weeks in summer, none in winter 0	Stop cutting in winter 3	As now, every 2/3 weeks summer, 6 weeks winter 4
Priority 90	32%	32%	36%
Priority 70	49%	31%	20%
Priority 50	71%	21%	7%
Priority 30	88%	9%	3%
Unacceptable	39%	16%	0%

Faced with the three service options, 39% of respondents thought the first option of every 4 weeks in summer and no cuts in winter was 'unacceptable', i.e. they would complain. 16% thought the second option, no winter cutting, was also unacceptable.

When they were given 30 points to allocate across all services 88% did not spend any on this attribute, 9% chose to spend 3 of them ensure continued current summer cut frequency, and 3% chose to allocate 4 of these 30 points to reinstate the current situation.

When they were given another 20 points (50 in total), 4% more respondents (7% - 3%) decided to achieve service option 3, either by investing an extra 1 point to improve from option 2, or by investing 4 points to improve from option 1. (Obviously the 3% already at option 3 did not have to 'spend' any more budget).

The relative priorities to achieve better services on the different service attributes can be deduced by comparing such tabulations in appendix 1.

Satisfaction with Alternative Scenarios

Before the main interview commenced respondents were asked for their ‘satisfaction’ with the current performance of the council. The response is shown below.

After respondents had designed their own personal budget allocation for each of the bonus priority scenarios, they were asked how pleased they would be if the council delivered this specification. Chart 2 shows 39% of the respondents to be ‘unhappy’ with the result of their first bonus of 30 points allocation, equivalent to saving the council about £2.8m on these service attributes. This percentage reduces to 9% after respondents had received the services they prioritised after allocating 70 points, still a £1.6m saving on the current budget on these services.

No information was given on possible tax impacts when asking for this reaction to the specification they designed.

It would seem that both councillors and those who were interviewed ‘face-to-face’ had better opinions of the council performance than ‘web respondents’. The face to face interviewees were mainly from deprived communities. National surveys show that it is common for the less well off to be more satisfied than average with their Councils.

Chart 2

Scenario	Very Unhappy	Slightly Unhappy	Uncertain	Quite Pleased	Very Pleased	Extremely Pleased
+30 Points	16%	23%	27%	27%	5%	2%
+50 Points	6%	14%	23%	42%	14%	2%
+70 Points	3%	6%	18%	38%	28%	6%
+90 Points	1%	4%	14%	31%	36%	14%
Current council perceptions						
Residents	4%	16%	18%	50%	11%	1%
Councillors	0%	19%	0%	44%	38%	0%
Face-to-face	2%	2%	20%	68%	7%	0%

Willingness to Pay For Alternative Scenarios

After all four stages of prioritisation had taken place, respondents were then told the possible impact on their council tax, that each scenario would cause and asked to select which was the most appealing, (Task 6). See Chart 3.

57% of the resident sample chose to save services and therefore pay an £8 or more increase in their council tax. Note that these scenarios were for their own individual budget allocations.

Chart 3: *Scenarios Chosen When Informed of its Council Tax Impact*

Scenario:	+30 Points	+50 Points	+70Points	+90 Points
Budget Equivalent	-£2.8m	-£2.2m	-£1.6m	-£1m
Approx. Tax Impact,	£8 Decrease	No change	£8 Increase	£16 Increase
Residents	14%	29%	22%	35%
Employees	6%	26%	25%	43%
Voluntary staff	6%	39%	30%	26%
Total web	10%	30%	25%	35%
Res. Under 35	16%	33%	36%	16%
Res. 35 - 54	9%	30%	19%	42%
Res. 55 - 64	14%	31%	19%	36%
Res. 65 +	19%	21%	21%	39%
Councillors	0%	31%	63%	6%
Face-to-face	5%	14%	29%	52%

There were only small differences between respondent groups in their preparedness to pay more tax for better services. Employees (and councillors and Face-to-face) were more prepared to pay for the better, more expensive specifications.

The youngest residents were less prepared to pay most for the least service savings.

Modelling SIMALTO data

The SIMALTO data summarised in the Appendix 1 is useful in its own right, and gives some fairly clear messages about most popular (e.g. Anti-social behaviour funding) and least popular (Bowling Green maintenance) service savings. However, it is not easy to assimilate this information for all the levels of the 20 services attributes, e.g. is cutting 2 subsidised bus routes more important than 50 fewer CCTV cameras? (Both save 2 grid points, £60k, on these attributes).

An influencer on this “importance” is the willingness to pay for an improvement, and what other items each respondent also wants improved. Fortunately, mathematical models can be built with this data to predict which changes to any given overall service specification would be preferred to other changes of similar cost.

These models can also predict the optimum “best value” specification at any given budget level, and how ‘pleased’ citizens would be with any given specification. These models use all the data from the SIMALTO grid. In essence the models assume that each individual resident would choose the budget allocation that offered him/her the best bargain, or best value. I.e. including as many of the options he/she valued highly, and excluding as many of the options he/she did not value highly, within any given fixed budget constraint. All the models work at the individual respondent level – there is no averaging of desires/priorities across respondents.

Optimum Best Value Total Budgets

SIMALTO Modelling can be used to predict the optimum ‘consensus’ budget allocation from the 256 web-residents’ point of view, for any given total budget cost ‘constraint’

Chart 4a. Resident Consensus Optimum Budget Allocations to £1.8m saving

The grey shading indicates savings in service level.

Total budget change SIMALTO Points	-£1.8m 64	-£1.5m 74	- £1.2m 84	-£900k 94	-£600k 104
1 CCTV cameras	20 fewer	20 fewer	20 fewer	As now	As now
2 Anti social behaviour fund	As now	As now	As now	As now	As now
3 Toilets	Close 12	Close 12	Close 9	As now	As now
4 Evening town cleaning	5 nights	5 nights	5 nights	5 nights	As now
5 Resident area litter	Every 16 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks
6 Refuse collection miss	15 months	15 months	15 months	15 months	18 months
7 Road, footpath repairs	5 days	3 days	3 days	3 days	As now
8 Out of hours service	Summer w/e	As now	As now	As now	As now
9 Day centres	Close 1, max 4	Close 1, max 4	Close 1, max 4	Close 1	As now
10 Home care	£100 limit	£150 limit	£150 limit	As now	As now
11 Grass cutting	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter	No winter	As now
12 Car parking charges	50p increase	As now	As now	As now	As now
13 Bowling greens maintenance.	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop
14 Trees	Charge fee	Charge fee	Charge fee	As now	As now
15 Flower baskets etc	No Wessex way	No Wessex way	No Wessex way	No Wessex way	As now
16 Bus subsidy	Cut 1 route	Cut 1 route	Cut 1 route	As now	As now
17 Youth centres	Close 1	Close 1	As now	As now	As now
18 Cemetery grass	8 weeks	8 weeks	8 weeks	6 weeks	6 weeks
19 Environmental health	No low risk	As now	As now	As now	As now
20 Planning enforcement	Only large	As now	As now	As now	As now

The grey shading indicates savings in service level.

Chart 4b. Resident Consensus Optimum Budget Allocations to £3m saving

Total budget change SIMALTO Points	-£3m 24	-£2.7m 34	- £2.4m 44	-£2.1m 54	-£1.8m 64
1 CCTV cameras	50 fewer	50 fewer	50 fewer	20 fewer	20 fewer
2 Anti social behaviour fund	As now	As now	As now	As now	As now
3 Toilets	Close 12 + 12	Close 12 + 12	Close 12	Close 12	Close 12
4 Evening town cleaning	w/e only	w/e only	w/e only	5 nights	5 nights
5 Resident area litter	Every 24 weeks	Every 24 weeks	Every 24 weeks	Every 16 weeks	Every 16 weeks
6 Refuse collection miss	12 months	12 months	12 months	12 months	15 months
7 Road, footpath repairs	7 days	7 days	7 days	5 days	5 days
8 Out of hours service	Summer w/e	Summer w/e	Summer w/e	Summer w/e	Summer w/e
9 Day centres	Only isolated	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 4
10 Home care	Same cost	£50 limit	£50 limit	£100 limit	£100 limit
11 Grass cutting	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer
12 Car parking charges	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p increase	50p increase
13 Bowling greens maintenance.	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop
14 Trees	Dangerous	Dangerous	No prevent	No prevent	Charge fee
15 Flower baskets etc	Remove all	Remove all	No Wessex way	No Wessex way	No Wessex way
16 Bus subsidy	Cut 3 routes	Cut 3 routes	Cut 2 routes	Cut 2 routes	Cut 1 route
17 Youth centres	Close 3	Close 2	Close 2	Close 2	Close 1
18 Cemetery grass	Start/end summer	Start/end summer	Start/end summer	8 weeks	8 weeks
19 Environmental health	Medium	Medium	No low risk	No low risk	No low risk
20 Planning enforcement	No small	Complaints	Complaints	Only large	Only large

Chart 4c. Alternative £2.4 million savings from the three main web samples plus councilors and the face-to-face samples

The grey shading indicates savings in service level.

Sample	Residents	Employees	Voluntary	Councillors	Face2face
1 CCTV cameras	50 fewer	50 fewer	50 fewer	80 fewer	50 fewer
2 Anti social behaviour fund	As now	As now	As now	Reduction	As now
3 Toilets	Close 12	Close 12 + 12	Close 12	Close 12 + 12	Close 12 + 12
4 Evening town cleaning	w/e only	w/e only	w/e only	w/e only	w/e only
5 Resident area litter	Every 24 weeks	Every 24 weeks	Every 24 weeks	Every 16 weeks	Every 16 weeks
6 Refuse collection miss	12 months	12 months	12 months	15 months	12 months
7 Road, footpath repairs	7 days	7 days	7 days	3 days	5 days
8 Out of hours service	Summer w/e	Summer w/e	Winter only	Summer w/e	Summer w/e
9 Day centres	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 4	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 4
10 Home care	£50 limit	£50 limit	£50 limit	£150 limit	£100 limit
11 Grass cutting	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer
12 Car parking charges	50p/hr at all	50p/hr increase	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all
13 Bowling greens maintenance	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop
14 Trees	No prevent	No prevent	No prevent	Dangerous	Dangerous
15 Flower baskets etc	No Wessex way	No Wessex way	No Wessex way	Remove all	Remove all
16 Bus subsidy	Cut 2 routes	Cut 2 routes	Cut 2 routes	Cut 1 route	Cut 2 routes
17 Youth centres	Close 2	Close 2	Close 1	Close 1	Close 1
18 Cemetery grass	Start/end summer	8 weeks	Start/end summer	Start/end summer	Start/end summer
19 Environmental health	No low risk	No low risk	No low risk	High	Medium
20 Planning enforcement	Complaints	Complaints	Complaints	Complaints	No small

Chart 4d. Councillors Consensus Optimum Budget Allocations

The grey shading indicates savings in service level.

Total budget change SIMALTO Points	-£3m 24	- £2.4m 44	-£1.8m 64	-£1.2m 84	-£600k 104
1 CCTV cameras	80 fewer	80 fewer	50 fewer	20 fewer	As now
2 Anti social behaviour fund	None	Reduction	As now	As now	As now
3 Toilets	Close 12 + 12	Close 12 + 12	Close 12	Close 12	Close 9
4 Evening town cleaning	Stop	w/e only	5 nights	5 nights	As now
5 Resident area litter	Every 24 weeks	Every 16 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks
6 Refuse collection miss	12 months	15 months	15 months	18 months	21 months
7 Road, footpath repairs	7 days	3 days	3 days	3 days	As now
8 Out of hours service	Winter	Summer w/e	As now	As now	As now
9 Day centres	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 4	Close 1	Close 1
10 Home care	£100 limit	£150 limit	£150 limit	As now	As now
11 Grass cutting	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter,	No winter
12 Car parking charges	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p increase	50p increase
13 Bowling greens maintenance.	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop	£50 fees
14 Trees	Dangerous	Dangerous	Dangerous	No prevent	Charge fee
15 Flower baskets etc	Remove all	Remove all	Remove all	No Wessex way	As now
16 Bus subsidy	Cut 3 routes	Cut 1 route	Cut 1 route	Cut 1 route	As now
17 Youth centres	Close 3	Close 1	Close 1	As now	As now
18 Cemetery grass	Start/end summer	Start/end summer	8 weeks	6 weeks	6 weeks
19 Environmental health	High	High	Medium	No low risk	As now
20 Planning enforcement	No small	Complaints	Only large	As now	As now

Chart 4e. Face-to-face sample Consensus Optimum Budget Allocations

The grey shading indicates savings in service level.

Total budget change SIMALTO Points	-£3m 24	- £2.4m 44	-£1.8m 64	-£1.2m 84	-£600k 104
1 CCTV cameras	50 fewer	50 fewer	20 fewer	20 fewer	As now
2 Anti social behaviour fund	Reduction	As now	As now	As now	As now
3 Toilets	Close 12 + 12	Close 12 + 12	Close 12	Close 12	Close 9
4 Evening town cleaning	Sat. only	w/e only	5 nights	5 nights	As now
5 Resident area litter	None	Every 16 weeks	Every 16 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks
6 Refuse collection miss	12 months	12 months	15 months	15 months	21 months
7 Road, footpath repairs	7 days	5 days	3 days	As now	As now
8 Out of hours service	Winter	Summer w/e	As now	As now	As now
9 Day centres	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 4	Close 1, max 4	As now	As now
10 Home care	£50 limit	£100 limit	£150 limit	As now	As now
11 Grass cutting	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter
12 Car parking charges	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	As now	As now
13 Bowling greens maintenance.	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop
14 Trees	Dangerous	Dangerous	Complaints	Charge fee	Charge fee
15 Flower baskets etc	Remove all	Remove all	Remove all	Remove all	As now
16 Bus subsidy	Cut 3 routes	Cut 2 routes	Cut 1 route	As now	As now
17 Youth centres	Close 2	Close 1	Close 1	As now	As now
18 Cemetery grass	Start/end summer	Start/end summer	8 weeks	6 weeks	As now
19 Environmental health	Medium	Medium	No low risk	As now	As now
20 Planning enforcement	Dangerous	No small	Complaints	Only large	As now

Chart 4f. Face-to-face B M E sample Consensus Optimum Budget Allocations

Note, Results from 10 respondents are only indicative.

Total budget change SIMALTO Points	-£3m 24	- £2.4m 44	-£1.8m 64	-£1.2m 84	-£600k 104
1 CCTV cameras	80 fewer	50 fewer	50 fewer	20 fewer	As now
2 Anti social behaviour fund	As now	As now	As now	As now	As now
3 Toilets	Close 14 + 18	Close 12 + 12	Close 12 + 12	Close 12	Close 9
4 Evening town cleaning	Sat. only	w/e only	5 nights	As now	As now
5 Resident area litter	Every 24 weeks	Every 16 weeks	Every 16 weeks	Every 8 weeks	Every 8 weeks
6 Refuse collection miss	12 months	12 months	18 months	18 months	21 months
7 Road, footpath repairs	7 days	5 days	3 days	As now	As now
8 Out of hours service	Winter	Winter	Summer w/e	As now	As now
9 Day centres	Close 1, max 3	Close 1, max 4	Close 1, max 4	Close 1	As now
10 Home care	£100 limit	£100 limit	£150 limit	£150 limit	As now
11 Grass cutting	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter, 4 weeks summer	No winter
12 Car parking charges	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p/hr at all	50p/hr increase	As now
13 Bowling greens maintenance.	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop	Stop
14 Trees	Dangerous	Dangerous	Complaints	Charge fee	As now
15 Flower baskets etc	Remove all	Remove all	Remove all	Remove all	Remove all
16 Bus subsidy	Cut 3 routes	Cut 1 route	Cut 1 route	Cut 1 route	As now
17 Youth centres	Close 3	Close 1	As now	As now	As now
18 Cemetery grass	Start/end summer	Start/end summer	8 weeks	6 weeks	As now
19 Environmental health	Medium	Medium	No low risk	No low risk	As now
20 Planning enforcement	Dangerous	No small	Complaints	Only large	As now

Best Value Hierarchy Index

Chart 5 below shows the complete hierarchy of residents 'value preference' index for the right hand member of each pair of adjacent options on the SIMALTO grid, all other options being fixed. This recognises the improved option will cost extra, 1 point = £30k.

Service Attribute	Change	Preference	Marginal cost
2 ASB fund	No budget → Reduced	94	1
4 Evening clean town centres	Stop → Saturday only	91	1
2 ASB fund	Reduced → as now	88	1
7 Road & footpath repairs	14 days → 7 days	87	1
5 Residential areas litter	Respond complaints → 24 weeks	86	4
3 Toilets	Close 14 + 18 → Close 12 + 12	86	5
20 Planning permission	Only dangerous → ignore small	84	1
4 Evening clean town centres	Saturday only → weekend only	84	2
1 CCTV cameras	80 fewer → 50 fewer	80	1
8 Out of hours service	24 hr winter → +w/e in summer	79	1
19 Environmental health	Only high risk → medium risk	78	2
20 Planning permission	ignore small → only complaints	78	1
17 Youth centres	Close 4 → Close 3	76	2
3 Toilets	Close 12 + 12 → Close 6 + 6	76	5
16 Subsidised bus routes	Cut 4 → cut 3	75	2
10 Home care	Equal residential → + £50	74	1
7 Road & footpath repairs	7 days → 5 days	74	1
9 Day centres	Isolated → Close 1 , max 3 days	73	7
17 Youth centres	Close 3 → Close 2	72	1
16 Subsidised bus routes	Cut 3 → cut 2	72	1
20 Planning permission	only complaints → +check large	71	1
14 Trees	Only dangerous → complaints	69	2
19 Environmental health	medium risk → ignore low risk	67	1
12 Car park charges	50p new, +50p current → +50p current	67	1
15 Flower baskets	No Wessex/town centre → no Wessex	66	1
4 Evening clean town centres	weekend only → 5 nights	65	1
10 Home care	+ £50 → + £100	64	1
1 CCTV cameras	50 fewer → 20 fewer	64	1
5 Residential areas litter	Clean every 24 weeks → 16 weeks	63	3
8 Out of hours service	+w/e in summer → as now	63	1
16 Subsidised bus routes	Cut 2 → cut 1	61	1
18 Cemetery grass cutting	Twice → every 8 weeks summer	59	1
19 Environmental health	ignore low risk → as now	58	1
14 Trees	complaints → charge fee	57	1
9 Day centres	Close 1 , max 3 days → max 4 days	57	3
17 Youth centres	Close 2 → Close 1	56	2
3 Toilets	Close 6 + 6 → Close 9 winter	53	5
12 Car park charges	+50p current → as now	53	1
7 Road & footpath repairs	5 days → 3 days	53	1
6 Refuse collection missed	12 months → 15 months	53	3
5 Residential areas litter	16 weeks → 8 weeks	52	3

10 Home care	+ £100 → + £150	50	1
20 Planning permission	+check large → as now	49	1
11 Grass cutting	Summer 4 weeks → not winter	49	3
16 Subsidised bus routes	Cut 1 → as now	46	1
9 Day centres	Close 1 , max 4 days → close 1	45	3
1 CCTV cameras	20 fewer → as now	44	1
17 Youth centres	Close 1 → as now	44	2
4 Evening clean town centres	5 nights → as now	43	1
14 Trees	charge fee → as now	41	2
7 Road & footpath repairs	3 days → as now	38	1
18 Cemetery grass cutting	every 8 weeks summer → every 6 weeks	38	1
10 Home care	+ £150 → as now	38	1
6 Refuse collection missed	15 months → 18 months	37	3
3 Toilets	Close 9 winter → as now	36	1
15 Flower baskets	No Wessex → as now	33	1
9 Day centres	close 1 → as now	33	3
5 Residential areas litter	8 weeks → as now	29	3
13 Bowling greens	Stop → 8 and £100 increase	28	3
11 Grass cutting	not winter → as now	26	1
6 Refuse collection missed	18 months → 21 months	22	3
18 Cemetery grass cutting	every 6 weeks → as now	20	1
13 Bowling greens	8 and £100 increase → 8 and £50 increase	18	2
6 Refuse collection missed	21 months → as now	18	3
13 Bowling greens	8 and £50 increase → 8, fee as now	12	2
13 Bowling greens	8, fee as now → as now	12	3

Satisfaction Predictions For Resident Optimum Budgets

Residents indicated how pleased they would be to receive each of their own personal allocation of budgets across the attributes. The SIMALTO Modelling can be used to predict, on the same scale, what resident satisfaction would be for any other allocation within the range of budget points spent. Chart 6 below shows this prediction for consensus optimal allocations shown in Chart 4a and 4b.

Potential dissatisfaction declines as the service savings decrease.

Budget Scenario	Very Unhappy	Slightly Unhappy	Uncertain	Quite Pleased	Very Pleased	Extremely Pleased
-£3m	35	22	17	20	5	2
-£2.4m	24	19	25	24	6	2
-£1.8m	11	17	27	35	9	2
-£1.2m	6	8	22	46	16	2
-£600k	3	6	19	40	24	8

Satisfaction Predictions for Respondent Optimum Budgets

Another forecast available from the SIMALTO Modelling simulation programs is to find the relative popularity between the alternative optimal allocations at each level of saving. Chart 7 shows the % of web respondents choosing each option.

Chart 7: % Preference between Optimal Consensus Budgets

Budget Change	-£3m	-£2.4m	-£1.8m	-£1.2m	-£600k
All respondents	11	15	25	25	24
Residents	12	15	21	26	25
Res. Under 35	12	21	28	24	16
Res. 35 - 54	13	13	16	28	30
Res. 55 - 64	13	12	23	26	26
Res. 65 +	10	19	23	25	22
Employees	8	15	29	22	25
Voluntary staff	12	15	30	26	18

Consensus preference is around a £1.3m saving level. (This is the level where about half respondents would prefer to pay below it, and half would prefer to pay above it, for the service levels postulated). The youngest residents are less likely to want to pay more tax for the better services.

Appendices

Appendix 1

Summary Data

APPENDIX 1: Summary Data

Detailed Summary of Seminars Priorities

The following tables summarise the information from the SIMALTO grid tasks for the total sample. The numbers refer to the *percentages* choosing the service levels indicated at each priority scenario.

1. CCTV cameras				
	80 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots in Bournemouth Town Centre only 0	50 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots 1	20 fewer cameras 2	As now – 140 CCTV cameras covering the Town centre, Boscombe, the seafront and Charminster 3
Bonus 90	14	15	16	54
Bonus 70	17	20	20	43
Bonus 50	27	23	24	26
Bonus 30	42	28	18	13
Unacceptable	70	42	19	0

2. Fund for tackling anti-social behaviour			
	No budget – no quick response to anti-social behaviour problems. Unable to take out any ASBOs or close drug dens. 0	Reduction in the speed and number of response to anti-social behaviour problems 1	As now – quick response to anti-social behaviour with measures such as anti-social behaviour orders (ASBOs), alleyway closures, closing drug dens etc. 2
Bonus 90	5	4	91
Bonus 70	9	5	86
Bonus 50	13	14	73
Bonus 30	21	27	52
Unacceptable	83	59	0

3. Public toilets (excluding parks)

	Permanently close 14 seafront toilets and 18 other public toilets 0	Permanently close 12 seafront and 12 other public toilets 5	Permanently close 6 seafront and 6 other public toilets 10	Close 9 seafront toilets between October and March 15	As now – 17 seafront toilets plus 23 other public toilets across borough 16
Bonus 90	6	9	14	20	52
Bonus 70	11	15	25	25	24
Bonus 50	25	23	28	11	13
Bonus 30	44	30	14	4	7
Unacceptable	82	66	45	23	0

4. Evening cleaning of Bournemouth, Boscombe and Charminster town centres

	Stop evening cleaning 0	Saturday night cleaning only 1	Weekend nights only 3	5 nights per week 4	As now – evening cleansing 7 nights per week 5
Bonus 90	4	1	12	26	57
Bonus 70	9	5	24	25	36
Bonus 50	17	16	25	22	21
Bonus 30	34	25	21	12	7
Unacceptable	80	64	48	22	0

5. Litter picking and sweeping of residential roads & outlying shopping areas

	No routine cleaning of residential roads, respond to complaints only 0	Clean or inspect every 24 weeks 4	Clean or inspect every 16 weeks 7	Clean or inspect every 8 weeks - 10	As now - residential roads & outlying shopping areas are cleaned or inspected every 4 weeks 13
Bonus 90	6	7	16	30	42
Bonus 70	11	22	24	21	22
Bonus 50	26	31	19	14	10
Bonus 30	47	30	13	5	4
Unacceptable	85	64	50	23	0

6. Refuse and Re-cycling collection

	Risk of missed bin approx every 12 months 0	Risk of missed bin approx every 15 months 3	Risk of missed bin approx every 18 months 6	Risk of missed bin approx every 21 months 9	As now – very reliable service. Risk of a missed bin collection approx once every 24 months. 12
Bonus 90	29	15	18	13	25
Bonus 70	44	22	13	7	13
Bonus 50	63	18	9	1	10
Bonus 30	79	13	2	2	5
Unacceptable	48	34	20	13	0

7. Road and footpath repairs

	Repaired within 14 days 0	Repaired within 7 days 1	Repaired within 5 days 2	Repaired within 3 days 3	As now – Defects which could endanger pedestrians or cyclists are repaired within 24 hours 4
Bonus 90	3	8	16	15	59
Bonus 70	9	19	21	21	31
Bonus 50	22	27	20	13	17
Bonus 30	52	25	7	6	10
Unacceptable	79	61	40	21	0

8. Out of hours service

	24 hour service in winter only 0	24hour service during the winter and weekends only in summer time 1	As now – 24 hour emergency service all year round covering things like winter gritting, clearing up after traffic accidents / vandalism, removal of fallen trees, creating diversions away from dangerous buildings etc. 3
Bonus 90	9	15	76
Bonus 70	18	23	59
Bonus 50	31	31	38
Bonus 30	55	33	13
Unacceptable	66	42	0

9. Day centres for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities

	Centres only available to isolated housebound clients or those whose carer is unable to cope alone 0	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 3 days per week 7	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 4 days per week 10	Close 1 centre and send its clients to other day centres 13	As now – 9 day care centres which some clients attend 5 days per week 16
Bonus 90	12	10	12	23	43
Bonus 70	21	18	25	14	21
Bonus 50	37	29	17	5	11
Bonus 30	62	23	8	4	4
Unacceptable	72	53	38	21	0

10. Home care for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities

	Only fund home care to the cost of residential care 0	Limit spending on a client's home care to £50 per week more than residential care costs 1	Limit spending to £100 per week more 2	Limit spending to £150 per week 3	As now – Council supports people to live in their own home even when this costs more than residential care 4
Bonus 90	15	9	15	16	45
Bonus 70	22	14	19	15	30
Bonus 50	38	20	14	10	18
Bonus 30	57	22	8	5	8
Unacceptable	61	46	35	23	0

11. Grass cutting of verges and residential areas

	Reduce grass cutting to every 4 weeks in Summer AND stop grass cutting in Winter 0	Stop grass cutting in Winter 3	As now – every 2/3 weeks in Summer and every 6 weeks in Winter 4
Bonus 90	31	32	36
Bonus 70	49	31	20
Bonus 50	71	21	7
Bonus 30	88	9	3
Unacceptable	39	16	0

12. Car park charges in parks and public open spaces

	Introduce a fee of 50 pence / hr at all other parks AND increase charges by 50p pence / hr where charges already apply 0	Increase car parking charges by 50 pence / hour where charges already apply 1	As now – charges apply at Hengistbury Head, the seafront and Tuckton tea gardens. Free parking in other parks. 2
Bonus 90	24	13	63
Bonus 70	33	17	50
Bonus 50	49	18	34
Bonus 30	63	16	21
Unacceptable	56	36	0

13. Bowling greens maintenance

	Council stops maintaining bowling greens. Clubs responsible for paying for own maintenance. 0	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and increases players' fees by £100 per year 3	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and increases players' fees by £50 per year 5	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and fees stay the same, 7	As now – Council maintains 16 bowling greens. Fees are £120 per year per player. 10
Bonus 90	57	16	11	5	12
Bonus 70	71	11	7	2	9
Bonus 50	81	10	2	1	6
Bonus 30	88	5	1	0	5
Unacceptable	31	20	12	9	0

14. Trees

	Service only deals with dangerous trees and keeping roads and footpaths clear 0	No preventative tree maintenance. Service responds to complaints only. 2	Charge a fee to deal with complaints about trees encroaching on private properties 3	As now - inspect and maintain half a million trees on public land 5
Bonus 90	15	12	22	50
Bonus 70	27	21	22	30
Bonus 50	43	21	19	17
Bonus 30	67	21	6	6
Unacceptable	64	50	27	0

15. Flower baskets and pedestals

	Remove floral baskets on Wessex Way and Castle Lane AND Bournemouth Town Centre 0	Remove floral baskets on Wessex Way and Castle Lane 1	As now – Floral baskets in key locations across the Borough 2
Bonus 90	29	28	43
Bonus 70	36	34	30
Bonus 50	46	38	17
Bonus 30	62	33	5
Unacceptable	49	18	0

16. Subsidised bus routes

	Cut 4 routes – affect 94000 passenger journeys per year 0	Cut 3 routes – affect 42000 passenger journeys per year 2	Cut 2 routes – affect 13000 passenger journeys per year 3	Cut one route – affect 3000 passenger journeys per year 4	As now – Council subsidises 30 bus routes 5
Bonus 90	10	4	11	20	54
Bonus 70	20	8	13	20	38
Bonus 50	32	14	17	15	21
Bonus 30	55	16	11	9	9
Unacceptable	71	63	46	33	0

17. Youth centres

	Close 4 youth centres – 0	Close 3 youth centres – 2	Close 2 youth centres – 3	Close 1 youth centre – 5	As now – 9 Council funded youth centres 7
Bonus 90	13	7	11	20	50
Bonus 70	21	7	19	20	33
Bonus 50	35	11	22	13	19
Bonus 30	53	13	15	9	10
Unacceptable	66	57	45	32	0

18. Grass cutting in cemeteries and crematorium

	Grass cut at beginning and end of Summer season only 0	Grass cut every 8 weeks in summer 1	Grass cut every 6 weeks in summer 2	As now – Grass cut and strimmed around graves and headstones once a month in Summer season 3
Bonus 90	23	23	24	30
Bonus 70	41	25	19	14
Bonus 50	57	24	13	6
Bonus 30	73	17	7	3
Unacceptable	51	29	10	0

19. Environmental Health, Trading Standards and Licensing

	Only businesses which pose highest risk are inspected AND low risk complaints are not investigated. 0	Medium risk businesses are only inspected if we receive a complaint AND low risk complaints are not investigated. 2	Low risk complaints are not investigated e.g. dog fouling, poor labelling, food product complaints etc 3	As now – all complaints are investigated AND medium and high risk business premises are routinely inspected 4
Bonus 90	11	8	12	69
Bonus 70	21	11	20	48
Bonus 50	31	18	19	32
Bonus 30	45	24	16	15
Unacceptable	70	57	36	0

20. Enforcement of planning permission

	No checks and service only responds to complaints about dangerous or listed buildings 0	No checks and no response to complaints about extensions or small developments 1	No checks – service only deals with complaints 2	Check large new builds only and deal with all complaints 3	As now – Council checks all new builds, investigates complaints and enforces planning permission where breaches found 4
Bonus 90	8	5	5	20	61
Bonus 70	14	6	11	26	43
Bonus 50	23	7	16	28	27
Bonus 30	37	11	19	21	12
Unacceptable	77	69	53	30	0

Appendix 2

Illustrative Questionnaire

Appendix 2: Illustrative Questionnaire

Research For Today 77 Gunnersbury Avenue, London W5 4LP
Telephone: 020 8992 4877 Fax: 020 8993 5818
E-mail:simalto@researchfortoday.com

Bournemouth Council Budget Consultation November 2009

Interviewer _____ Date _____

Respondent _____ Name: _____
Mr/Mrs/Ms/Miss _____

Address _____

Postcode _____ Telephone Number _____

Quota Sheet Number	
--------------------	--

Introduction

Hello. My name is _____ from Research For Today Ltd, an independent market research company.

We are conducting research to find out your opinions about the way you would prefer council to allocate elements of their budget over the next year.

All the opinions you express and information you give will be treated confidentially.

Introduction to SIMALTO

Bournemouth Borough Council needs your views on spending on *some* of the services they provide. Bournemouth anticipates having less money in future to spend on services and needs to understand their residents' priorities to help them balance their books in this tight financial climate.

S1 Before we begin collecting your views on different services, thinking of the overall service the council **currently** provides, how pleased are you with their service?

SHOW CARD X

Extremely pleased.....	6
Very pleased.....	5
Quite pleased.....	4
Uncertain.....	3
Slightly unhappy	2
Very unhappy	1

I am going to ask you some questions that will require the use of some special answer sheets. These sheets will help us collect your views and priorities.

HAND RESPONDENT SIMALTO SHEET AND INTRODUCE THE SHEET

Down the left hand side of the sheet is a list of services that are provided (**POINT TO THE LEFT HAND COLUMN**). To the right are the different levels and options that *could* be provided of each service. First of all please take a couple of minutes or so to read through the sheet and make sure you understand all the options. The shaded box indicates the level of service the council currently provides. Any service options to the left of the shaded box are a *poorer level* of service than is currently provided but would save the council costs and help keep council tax as low as possible. We are going to ask you to carry out a number of tasks on this grid

HAND RESPONDENT RED PEN

S2 For the moment, please ignore the numbers in the right hand corner of the option boxes. First of all, using the red pen, please cross out any option on any row that would strongly make you want to complain if this **reduced level** of service was provided. We do not want you to cross out those saving options you do not like, but only those that are totally unacceptable – so unacceptable that, if provided by the council, they would **actually cause you to write or telephone** to complain to the council or to your councilor.

Some rows will have no crosses. Some rows may have 2 or more crosses. It's up to you to say which options, if any, would cause you to contact and complain to the council.

IF NECESSARY KEEP REMINDING RESPONDENT THESE ARE TOTALLY UNACCEPTABLE OPTIONS, ON OR TO THE LEFT OF SHADED BOXES.

CONTINUE WITH RED PEN

S3 Now I would like you to place a tick against the 5 or 6 attributes that you think are most important, for both yourself and the local community. Please make your ticks in the column to the left of the attribute description.

S4. The black circles on this sheet show **the worst level of service** on each row - a **very basic level of service that a council might provide**. This level is generally poorer than the service currently being delivered by your council, which is shown by the shaded option boxes. Please read again the service shown by the black circles. **If** the council provided this very basic level of service next year, how pleased would you be?

SHOW CARD X

Extremely pleased	6
Very Pleased	5
Quite Pleased	4
Uncertain.....	3
Slightly Unhappy	2
Very Unhappy	1

ANSWER TO S4 SHOULD BE POORER THAN S1 IF NOT ASK S4A

S4A I notice that you say you would be more pleased with the service shown by the “black circles” than the service you receive today – is that correct? The “black circles” service is worse than the service provided today.

Yes	2 → CONTINUE
No.....	1 → AMEND S4

CONTINUE WITH RED PEN

S5. The sheet has allocations of points for each option of each attribute. These small figures in the bottom right hand corner of each box on the grid represent the relative cost of that option compared with other options on that row. As service performance improves from the left to the right on each attribute, costs and so the points for each option increase.

Using the points in each box, please tell me how you would most like to move away from the very basic black-circled budget allocation to make it more appropriate to your priorities. Imagine that the council did not want their service to be at this very basic black circle level and allocated ***approximately 30*** points for this purpose. Please use red arrows to show how you would improve the basic circled package by a total of **between 28 and 32 points**. You may make as many or as few improvements as you like by drawing a red arrow from the circled package to those levels you would like to achieve.

Please use these 30 points to show your top priority changes. **I will later be giving you extra points to spend**, but first we need to know your top priorities, for **yourself and the local community**. Please note that if you do not improve beyond any unacceptable level you may have indicated, these unimproved unacceptable levels will still be part of the overall service delivered.

INTERVIEWER: RESPONDENTS SHOULD TRY TO IMPROVE BEYOND CROSSED OUT LEVELS OF SERVICES, IF POSSIBLE. IF THEY HAVE NOT, and instead improved others, THEN SAY TO THEM

I notice you have not improved services you have crossed out. This means that those crossed out services are part of your package. Do you wish to change any of the improvements you have made so you can use points to improve these “unacceptable” levels of services?

KEEP A TALLY OF ALL IMPROVEMENTS MADE

= 30 ± 2

S6. If the council provided this very basic black pre-circled level, except where improved by your red arrows, how pleased would you be? **SHOW CARD X**

- Extremely pleased..... 6
- Very pleased..... 5
- Quite pleased..... 4
- Uncertain..... 3
- Slightly unhappy 2
- Very unhappy 1

INTERVIEWER ANSWER MUST BE THE SAME OR BETTER THAN S4.

HAND RESPONDENT BLACK PEN

S7. Now I would like you to spend **another 20 points** assuming you already have the first red arrow improvements you have made to basic services. What other improvements would you most like? Please now use black arrows to show how you would prefer the council to allocate these *extra* 20 points. You can decide to change new attributes or further improve the level of service of some choices you have made already. If you improve from a box marked '2 points' to a box marked '5 points', this will only cost you the difference of '3 points' (5 minus 2 points).

INTERVIEWER: CHECK ALL BLACK ARROWS START FROM THE END OF A RED ARROW (IF THERE IS A RED ARROW ON THAT ROW) OR A BLACK PRE-CIRCLE. CHECK RESPONDENT HAS SPENT 7 MORE POINTS. KEEP A TALLY OF ALL IMPROVEMENTS MADE AT S6

= 20 ±

1

CHECK TOTAL OF S5 + S7 = 50 +/- 1 POINTS

INTERVIEWER: RESPONDENTS SHOULD HAVE TRIED TO IMPROVE BEYOND ALL CROSSED OUT LEVELS OF SERVICES BY THIS STAGE. IF THEY HAVE NOT THEN SAY TO THEM: - I notice you have not improved services you have crossed out. This means that those crossed out services are part of your package. Do you wish to change any of the improvements you have made to use points to improve these “unacceptable” levels of services?

S8. If the council provided this level of service (the basic black pre-circles except where improved by both your red and black arrows), how pleased would you be?

SHOW CARD X

Extremely pleased.....	6
Very pleased.....	5
Quite pleased.....	4
Uncertain.....	3
Slightly unhappy	2
Very unhappy	1

INTERVIEWER: ANSWER MUST BE THE SAME OR BETTER THAN S6

HAND RESPONDENT GREEN PEN

S9. Imagine that the council could improve the basic services still further and allocated **another 20 points** for this purpose. Please use green arrows to show how you would prefer them to change your already improved package by a further 20 points. Just to remind you, you must start from the end of a black arrow if there is one on the row, or a red arrow, or a black pre-circled box, if you have not already improved that service. Assume you already have the improvements you have already selected, and that becomes the starting point for this next set of improvements.

Also please remember that the costs in these boxes are cumulative. So moving to the right from a box costing 2 points to a box costing 6 points contributes the difference of 4 points to your overall target of another 20 points.

KEEP TALLY OF COST OF IMPROVEMENTS MADE

<input type="text"/>	= 20 ± 1
----------------------	-----------------

S10. If the council provided this new level of service (the basic pre-circled level plus all your red, black and green arrowed improvements), how pleased would you be? **SHOW CARD X**

Extremely pleased.....	6
Very pleased.....	5
Quite pleased.....	4
Uncertain.....	3
Slightly unhappy	2
Very unhappy	1

INTERVIEWER: ANSWER MUST BE THE SAME OR BETTER THAN S8

HAND RESPONDENT BLUE PEN

S11. Imagine finally that the council could improve their services still further and allocated a **final 20 points** for this purpose. Please use blue arrows to show how you would prefer them to change your already improved allocation by a further 20 points. Just to remind you, you must start from the end of a green arrow if there is one on the row or a black or a red arrow - or a black pre-circled box, if you have not already improved that service. Assume you already have the all the improvements you have already selected and that is the starting point for these final improvements.

Also please remember that the costs in these boxes are cumulative. So moving to the right from a box costing 2 points to a box costing 6 points contributes the difference of 4 points to your overall target of 20 points.

KEEP TALLY OF COST OF IMPROVEMENTS MADE

	= 20 ± 1
--	-----------------

S12. If the council provided these services (the basic pre-circled level plus all your red, black, green and blue arrowed improvements), how pleased would you be?

SHOW CARD X

Extremely pleased.....	6
Very pleased.....	5
Quite pleased.....	4
Uncertain.....	3
Slightly unhappy	2
Very unhappy	1

INTERVIEWER: ANSWER MUST BE THE SAME OR BETTER THAN S10

S13. SHOW RESPONDENT COMPLETED SIMALTO SHEET READ OUT

The council Tax the council has to charge is affected by several things. First, although the Government calculates how much it thinks councils need to spend to meet the needs of their communities and gives them Revenue Support Grant to cover part of this spending, it doesn't give them all the money they need. So they have to increase Council Tax to meet the Government's calculations, and to meet their obligations to provide better and more costly services, the increasing costs of caring for the growing numbers of elderly people, increasing volumes of refuse to be collected and disposed of and so on.

To do this for 2010, for instance, the council will have to reduce some services to enable them to try to maintain current standards on others. Please take another look at your completed sheet. The different allocations you indicated might result in the following alternatives to the current level of council tax being charged, for next year. Assuming they ignore an inflation increase, which of these four scenarios is most appealing to you?

SHOW RESPONDENT COMPLETED SIMALTO SHEET AND SHOW CARD Z

The basic black circled allocation PLUS the first round of improvements (red arrows) at approx. £8 less increase (16 pence / week less) in council tax for typical Band D home	1
The allocation after 2 rounds of improvements (black circles PLUS red and black arrows) at approx. inflation increase.	2
The allocation after 3 rounds of improvements (red, black and green arrows) at approx. £8 a year larger increase (16 p / week more) in council tax for typical Band D home.	3
The allocation after all 4 rounds of improvements (red, black, green and blue arrows) at approx. £16 a year larger increase (30 p / week increase) in council tax for typical Band D home.	4

S15. Could you tell me if this household pays full council tax, a reduced rate (for single occupancy etc) or is exempt from paying council tax?

- Full 1
- Reduced 2
- Exempt (Pays no council tax) 3
- Don't know 4

Appendix 3

SIMALTO Grid

Bournemouth budget consultancy

SERVICE		OPTIONS					
1	CCTV cameras	80 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots in Bournemouth Town Centre only 0	50 fewer cameras – coverage limited to worst crime hotspots 1	20 fewer cameras 2	As now – 140 CCTV cameras covering the Town centre, Boscombe, the seafront and Charminster 3		
2	Fund for tackling anti-social behaviour	No budget – no quick response to anti-social behaviour problems. Unable to take out any ASBOs or close drug dens 0	Reduction in the speed and number of response to anti-social behaviour problems 1		As now – quick response to anti-social behaviour with measures such as anti-social behaviour orders (ASBOs), alleyway closures, closing drug dens etc. 2		
3	Public toilets (excluding parks)	Permanently close 14 seafront toilets and 18 other public toilets 0	Permanently close 12 seafront and 12 other public toilets 5	Permanently close 6 seafront and 6 other public toilets 10	Close 9 seafront toilets between October and March 15	As now – 17 seafront toilets plus 23 other public toilets across borough 16	
4	Evening cleaning of Bournemouth, Boscombe and Charminster town centres	Stop evening cleaning 0	Saturday night cleaning only 1	Weekend nights only 3	5 nights per week 4	As now – evening cleansing 7 nights per week 5	
5	Litter picking and sweeping of residential roads & outlying shopping areas	No routine cleaning of residential roads, respond to complaints only 0	Clean or inspect every 24 weeks 4	Clean or inspect every 16 weeks 7	Clean or inspect every 8 weeks - 10	As now - residential roads & outlying shopping areas are cleaned or inspected every 4 weeks 13	
6	Refuse and Re-cycling collection	Risk of missed bin approx every 12 months 0	Risk of missed bin approx every 15 months 3	Risk of missed bin approx every 18 months 6	Risk of missed bin approx every 21 months 9	As now – very reliable service. Risk of a missed bin collection approx once every 24 months. 12	
7	Road and footpath repairs	Repaired within 14 days 0	Repaired within 7 days 1	Repaired within 5 days 2	Repaired within 3 days 3	As now – Defects which could endanger pedestrians or cyclists are repaired within 24 hours 4	
8	Out of hours service	24 hour service in winter only 0	24hour service during the winter and weekends only in summer time 1	As now – 24 hour emergency service all year round covering things like winter gritting, clearing up after traffic accidents / vandalism, removal of fallen trees, creating diversions away from dangerous buildings etc. 3			
9	Day centres for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities	Centres only available to isolated housebound clients or those whose carer is unable to cope alone 0	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 3 days per week 7	Close 1 centre AND reduce number of days people can attend to max 4 days per week 10	Close 1 centre and send its clients to other day centres 13	As now – 9 day care centres which some clients attend 5 days per week 16	
10	Home care for older people and people with physical and learning disabilities	Only fund home care to the cost of residential care 0	Limit spending on a client's home care to £50 per week more than residential care costs 1	Limit spending to £100 per week more 2	Limit spending to £150 per week 3	As now – Council supports people to live in their own home even when this costs more than residential care 4	
11	Grass cutting of verges and residential areas	Reduce grass cutting to every 4 weeks in Summer AND stop grass cutting in Winter 0		Stop grass cutting in Winter 3	As now – every 2/3 weeks in Summer and every 6 weeks in Winter 4		

12	Car park charges in parks and public open spaces	Introduce a fee of 50 pence / hr at all other parks AND increase charges by 50p pence / hr where charges already apply	0	Increase car parking charges by 50 pence / hour where charges already apply	1	As now – charges apply at Hengistbury Head, the seafront and Tuckton tea gardens. Free parking in other parks.	2				
13	Bowling greens maintenance	Council stops maintaining bowling greens. Clubs responsible for paying for own maintenance	0	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and increases players' fees by £100 per year	3	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and increases players' fees by £50 per year	5	Council maintains 8 bowling greens and fees stay the same,	7	As now – Council maintains 16 bowling greens. Fees are £120 per year per player.	10
14	Trees	Service only deals with dangerous trees and keeping roads and footpaths clear	0	No preventative tree maintenance. Service responds to complaints only.	2	Charge a fee to deal with complaints about trees encroaching on private properties	3	As now - inspect and maintain half a million trees on public land	5		
15	Flower baskets and pedestals	Remove floral baskets on Wessex Way and Castle Lane AND Bournemouth Town Centre	0	Remove floral baskets on Wessex Way and Castle Lane	1	As now – Floral baskets in key locations across the Borough	2				
16	Subsidised bus routes	Cut 4 routes – affect 94000 passenger journeys per year	0	Cut 3 routes – affect 42000 passenger journeys per year	2	Cut 2 routes – affect 13000 passenger journeys per year	3	Cut one route – affect 3000 passenger journeys per year	4	As now – Council subsidises 30 bus routes	5
17	Youth centres	Close 4 youth centres –	0	Close 3 youth centres –	2	Close 2 youth centres –	3	Close 1 youth centre –	5	As now – 9 Council funded youth centres	7
18	Grass cutting in cemeteries and crematorium	Grass cut at beginning and end of Summer season only	0	Grass cut every 8 weeks in summer	1	Grass cut every 6 weeks in summer	2	As now – Grass cut and strimmed around graves and headstones once a month in Summer season	3		
19	Environmental Health, Trading Standards and Licensing	Only businesses which pose highest risk are inspected AND low risk complaints are not investigated.	0	Medium risk businesses are only inspected if we receive a complaint AND low risk complaints are not investigated.	2	Low risk complaints are not investigated e.g. dog fouling, poor labelling, food product complaints etc	3	As now – all complaints are investigated AND medium and high risk business premises are routinely inspected	4		
20	Enforcement of planning permission	No checks and service only responds to complaints about dangerous or listed buildings	0	No checks and no response to complaints about extensions or small developments	1	No checks – service only deals with complaints	2	Check large new builds only and deal with all complaints	3	As now – Council checks all new builds, investigates complaints and enforces planning permission where breaches found	4